

## **Lima Historic Preservation Commission Year End Summary 2019**

December 31, 2019

To: Supervisor Mike Falk and Lima Town Board Members  
Mayor Carl Luft and Lima Village Board Members

**From: Historic Preservation Commission**

Fran Gotcsik  
Robin Ha (partial year prior to moving to Honeoye Falls)  
Robin Hargrave  
Don Brown (consultant)

Below is a brief summary of the activities carried out by the Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) during 2019. See attached reports for specifics. Not all HPC recommendations were implemented as the HPC's role is only advisory.

In October, HPC member Fran Gotcsik attended the Commission Assistance and Mentoring Program full-day training (CAMP) in Syracuse presented by the National Alliance of Preservation Commissions (NAPC) and the Preservation League of New York State. NAPC's mission is to build strong local preservation programs through education, advocacy and training. The program offered an opportunity to interact with other HPC members from across the state, receive informational materials, and participate in discussions that were helpful to better understanding the role of a member of an HPC.

### **LIMA HPC ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW REFERRALS**

The referrals were all received from Lima's Code Enforcement Officer. HPC meetings were held to review each referral, usually on site and in conjunction with the landowner, followed by email correspondence among HPC members. HPC recommendations were transmitted to the CEO.

We thank the Lima Town and Village Boards for their ongoing support of Lima's Historic Preservation Commission. We appreciate the boards' recognition of the value of Lima's historic architectural assets, and the opportunity to be of service to the community in their preservation.

We are eager to add members to the Commission.

### **1883 Rochester Street**

A National Register-listed c. 1860s vernacular Greek Revival commercial building with three store fronts and residential apartments on the second floor, located in the Lima Village National Register Historic District. The building is significant for the role it played in commercial activity in the village and for the amount of historic fabric still remaining, especially the cabinetry in the building's center retail space.

Work under review included a proposed addition of a 400 sf equipment porch and a 420sf fenced-in patio to the rear (east elevation) of the building. The HPC also offered preliminary feedback on initial stages of façade improvement involving removal of the shake shingle shed roof above the storefront windows across the Rochester Street (front, west) façade of the building. At a later date, the building owners will return to the HPC for additional recommendations regarding lighting, paint color choices, signage, and other issues that may arise subsequent to further exploration of the building.

### **1881 Rochester Street**

A National Register-listed three-bay, two story c. 1860s brick commercial building located in the Lima Village National Register Historic District. The HPC recommended denial of the application to replace the three second floor 8-foot windows on the front façade with smaller windows with transoms. The HPC spoke on several occasions and the building owner regarding more effective and compatible, and much cheaper alternatives. The building owner eventually decided to install wooden storm windows as recommended by the HPC.

### **1893 Rochester Street**

A National Register-listed c. 1860 one bay corner storefront in the Masonic/Lockington Block building located in the Lima Village National Register Historic District. The HPC provided recommendations on the concrete ramp and hand rail design as well as the panel design of the exterior door.

## **Lima Historic Preservation Commission**

**Property:** 1883 Rochester Street, a National Register listed c. 1860s vernacular Greek Revival commercial building with three store fronts and residential apartments on the second floor. The building is significant for the role it played in commercial activity in the village and for the amount of historic fabric still remaining, especially the cabinetry in the building's center retail space.

**Meeting Date:** August 24, 2019

**Individuals present:** On-site, members of the Lima Historic Preservation Commission (HPC), Don Brown and Fran Gotcsik reviewed the proposed changes to the rear (east elevation) of the building.

Other individuals present:

- Owners Jacob and Leta Button
- Proposed tenant for the three street level storefronts Jon Belec, owner of Jonny B's BBQ
- Project architect Robin Hargrave of Hargrave Collaborative A&E. Ms. Hargrave is a member of the HPC but, as project architect, has recused herself from participation in development of HPC recommendations for this project.
- George Gotcsik, Lima Planning Board – for information only
- Mike Falk, Lima Town Supervisor

**Meeting Purpose:** The purpose of the meeting was for the HPC to provide the owners with feedback on the following areas:

- proposed addition of a 400 sf equipment porch and a 420sf fenced-in patio to the rear (east elevation) of the building to accommodate the smoker and cooler associated with the barbeque restaurant and outdoor dining associated with the restaurant and music performance space, as detailed in the site plan and building elevations
- initial stages of façade improvement involving removal of the shake shingle shed roof above the storefront windows across the Rochester Street (front, west) façade of the building.

At a later date, the building owners will return to the HPC for additional recommendations regarding lighting, paint color choices, signage, and other issues that may arise subsequent to further exploration of the building.

The HPC commended the building owners and commercial tenant for actively soliciting input from the HPC and their commitment to improving and adding to the vibrancy of our community as well as one of Lima's historic commercial buildings.

### **Recommendations - Proposed Additions to the rear (east elevation) of the building**

HPC members discussed many environmental aspects (sight, sound, smells, lighting) that could impact diners, building tenants and surrounding building occupants.

1. Relationship of proposed patio to existing parking lot. - Consideration should be given to means of preventing vehicles from colliding with the patio or diminishing the outdoor dining experience. Trees planted between the parking lot and patio could provide an additional barrier and screen.
2. Location and height of the smoker pipe – Information on the proposed stack was offered by Ms. Hargrave. It will be limited in height and fit well with the design of the addition. It was suggested that, if possible, a shiny metal surface for the stack should be avoided.
3. Screening for or relocation of the electric boxes – Screening material was discussed and is located on Drawing Sk2. Relocation to the south wall will be explored.
4. Location and impact of sound from operation of compressors and AC units on building tenants and restaurant patrons. - The potential for concern was noted, but no details on location and decibels were available.
5. Design of the equipment porch – The shed roof mimics a shed shown on the building in a 1950s aerial photo. The architect's elevation drawing indicates use of wood materials in cornice, porch framing, transom panels, and porch apron panels to reflect design elements found in the front (west) elevation of the building. The HPC supports these designs and choice of materials.
6. Location and screening of dumpster – Location of the dumpster for the building was uncertain. It was suggested that location and use of screening should be employed to ensure a pleasing environment for patio diners.
7. Location of rear steps - Presently the steps enter directly into the parking lot – Turning the steps 90 degrees could lessen the chance that they would be impacted by a vehicle
8. Ownership and utilization of the existing alley area that leads to the pocket park on Rochester Street. - The potential for more expansive outdoor seating was noted, but no information was available on ownership and/or legality of use of this location.

### **Recommendations – Removal of shake shingle shed roof from front (west) elevation**

1. The HPC supported the initiation of this phase of removal and discovery but noted that once the materials are removed there may be a need to review further actions, based on what is found. As the shingle shed roof has existed for possibly 50 years or more, the condition of the underlying colored glass and window transom is uncertain.

## Lima Historic Preservation Commission

### 1881 Rochester Street

An application was received on February 1, 2019 from Cali Enterprises and Son, LLC. to replace the three second floor 8-foot windows on the front façade with smaller windows with transoms. No specifics on the size of replacement windows was provided.

#### History

The structure is a 19<sup>th</sup> century three-bay, two story c. 1860s brick commercial building located in, and a contributing member of, the Lima Village National Register Historic District. The National Register information (Item #7, page 4) states,

“...the commercial block on lower Rochester Street continues with and imposing pair of two-story 1860s brick buildings at 1883-85 (the Ellis Block) and 1881 Rochester Street. Like the American Hotel, the eleven-bay-wide Ellis Block and the three-bay wide building at 1881 Rochester Street are retardataire manifestations of Greek Revival style commercial architecture with flat-arched stone lintels and sills and wide brick friezes with dentils.”

#### Recommendations and Comments

February 12, 2019

The application was distributed electronically on February 6, 2019 to members of the Historic Preservation Commission (HPC).

All have reviewed the application and recommend that the request be denied for the following reasons:

1. The change would not satisfy the intent of the Town and Village of Lima to “preserve and enhance the appearance and historical character of the building involved and those buildings in close proximity to historical buildings,” as stated in the Historical Preservation Commission Review Application.
2. The HPC is charged with basing its recommendations on the *Lima, NY Façade Renovation Guidelines, 2010*. Those Guidelines state on p. 10, Upper Floor Windows: “Restore original openings whenever possible. **Do** maintain or restore original window openings; **do not** reduce window openings.”
3. The windows define the character of and are important features of the building as well as the series of multi-story brick commercial structures that line Rochester and Main

Streets surrounding the Four Corners within the village. No other windows in the village National Register Historic District have been shortened with the addition of transoms.

4. The present windows can be restored and wooden storm windows added. Contact Steve Jordan, a nationally recognized window restorer living in Rochester, and someone who is very reasonably priced and familiar with Lima and its buildings You can email Steve at [painintheglass@frontiernet.net](mailto:painintheglass@frontiernet.net). He also has a website at <http://painintheglass.us>. Another experienced preservation contractor whose is a former HPC member and Lima resident, is Peter Trieb [Peter@preservationmatters.com](mailto:Peter@preservationmatters.com) or 259-1744.
5. The Andersen window catalog has a double hung window in the 8'-0" height. It is an A-Series Andersen window, which can be special ordered through Morse Sash & Door in Henrietta, Matthews & Fields, or 84 Lumber. The E-series is a second option, which would offer an aluminum clad wooden window but likely at a higher price The Anderson line at Home Depot is not the same. Those windows are a wood and plastic composite.

It is the opinion of an HPC member, who is an architect, that Andersen is a good choice as they balance energy efficient properties and price point. Her clients have found Pella, Marvin and the like to be costlier in general.

..

6. A vinyl window may not have the strength for the 8-foot size.

Lima Historic Preservation Commission

Recommendation

October 9, 2019

1893 Rochester Street

Members of the Lima Historic Preservation Commission (HPC), Fran Gotcsik and Robin Hargrave, reviewed the application for construction of a ramp and re-installation of a door opening onto the Rochester Street sidewalk from the small ground floor commercial space at the southwest corner of 1893 Rochester Street, the c. 1860 National Register-listed Masonic/Lockington Block building.

**Ramp:** The HPC supports the installation of a concrete ramp to provide universal access to the small ground floor commercial space at the southwest corner of the building. The HPC supports the installation of iron railings but recommends improving the treatment of the hand rail return.

**Door:** The HPC would prefer a door with vertical panels as the original at this location and as presently exists at the second floor stairway, pictured in the example provided by the applicant to illustrate color selection. However, the HPC recognizes that the door design in the elevation accompanying the application reflects other replaced doors on the building.